

A Gay Monk
Paṇḍaka-vatthu (Vi-3, 119)

Tena kho pana samayena aññataro paṇḍako bhikkhūsu pabbajito hoti, so dahare dahare bhikkhū upasaṅkamitvā evaṃ vadeti “Etha maṃ āyasmanto dūsethā”ti. Bhikkhū apasāḍenti, “nassa paṇḍaka, vinassa paṇḍaka, ko tayā attho”ti.

At that time a gay has been ordained among the monks. He approached every young monk and spoke thus: “Come, venerable ones, ruin me.” The monks disparaged him thus: “Perish, gay; totally perish, gay; what to do with you!” Thus they said.

<i>tena kho pana samayena</i>	time adverb phrase	at that time	<i>pabbajito hoti</i> (present perfect)	<i>kālādhāra</i>
<i>aññataro</i>	PG-19, 1 Sg.	a	<i>paṇḍako</i>	adjective
<i>paṇḍako</i>	NG-1, 1 Sg.	gay	<i>pabbajito hoti</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>bhikkhūsu</i>	NG-17, 7 Pl.	among the monks	<i>pabbajito hoti</i>	<i>desādhāra</i>
<i>pabbajito hoti</i>	V-1, 3 Sg.	has been ordained		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>so</i>	PG-6, 1 Sg.	he	<i>upasaṅkamitvā, vadeti</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>dahare dahare</i>	NG-1, 2 Pl.	every young	<i>bhikkhū</i>	adjective
<i>bhikkhū</i>	NG-17, 2 Pl.	monks	<i>upasaṅkamitvā</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>upasaṅkamitvā</i>	Nip.	approached and	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>pubbakāla kriyā visesana</i>
<i>evaṃ</i>	Nip.	Thus (in the following way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>nidassana</i>
<i>vadeti</i>	V-1, 3 Sg.	spoke		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“etha</i>	V-2, 2 Pl.	come!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>maṃ</i>	PG-1, 2 Sg.	me	<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>āyasmanto</i>	Voc.	venerable ones	<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>dūsetha</i>	V-2, 2 Pl.	ruin		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>iti</i>	Nip.	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka</i> (speaking-manner indicator)
<i>bhikkhū</i>	NG-17, 1 Pl.	the monks	<i>apasāḍenti</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>apasāḍenti</i> ¹	V-1, 3 Pl.	disparaged <u>him</u>		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“nassa</i> ²	V-2, 2 Sg.	perish!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>paṇḍaka</i>	Voc.	gay		<i>āpalana</i>
<i>vinassa</i>	V-2, 2 Sg.	totally perish!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>paṇḍaka</i>	Voc.	gay		<i>āpalana</i>
<i>ko</i>	PG-15, 1 Sg.	what	1. <i>attho</i> 2. <i>hoti</i> (understood)	adjective <i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>tayā</i>	PG-2, 3 Sg.	with you	<i>ko attho</i>	<i>Sahādi-yoga</i>
<i>attho</i> ³	NG-1, 1 Sg.	good, benefit, something to do ³	1. <i>hoti</i> (is there) 2. <i>hoti</i> (is)	<i>kattā</i> <i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>iti</i>	Nip.	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>apasāḍenti</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka</i> –

¹ *Apasāḍenti* pr. (+acc) disparages; belittles; puts down; lit. causes to sink away [*apa* + √*sad* + **e* + *ti*]

² *nassati* 1 pr. perishes; ends; is destroyed; lit. disappears [√*nas* + *ya* + *ti*]. Root √*nas* 3 ya (be lost, disappear) 66.

³ “*ko attho*” means “what to do,” as in the case of “*kiṃ kiccaṃ atthaṃ idha atthi tuyhaṃ*” (Jā-1, 199) in which *kiccaṃ* (something to do) is expressed as *atthaṃ*, i.e., the two are synonyms. [In this case “*atthaṃ*” is NG-2 to agree with “*kiccaṃ*.”]

				(speaking-manner indicator)
--	--	--	--	-----------------------------

So bhikkhūhi apasādito mahante mahante molī-galle sāmaṇere upasaṅkamtivā evaṃ vadeti, “Etha maṃ āvuso dūsethā”ti. Sāmaṇerā apasādentī, “nassa paṇḍaka, vinassa paṇḍaka, ko tayā attho”ti.

He —disparaged by the monks —approached every big and fat novices and, spoke thus: “Come, friends, ruin me.” The novices disparaged him thus: “Perish, gay; totally perish, gay; what to do with you! ”

<i>so</i>	<i>PG-6, 1 Sg.</i>	he	<i>1. apasādito 2. upasaṅkamtivā, vadeti</i>	<i>1. kamma 2. kattā</i>
<i>bhikkhūhi</i>	<i>NG-17, 3 Pl.</i>	by the monks	<i>apasādito</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>apasādito (pass.)</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	(being) disparaged	<i>hutvā/samāno (understood)</i>	<i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>mahante mahante</i>	<i>NG-6, 2 Pl.</i>	every big	<i>sāmaṇere</i>	adjective
<i>molīgalle</i>	<i>NG-1, 2 Pl.</i>	fat	<i>sāmaṇere</i>	adjective
<i>sāmaṇere</i>	<i>NG-1, 2 Pl.</i>	novices	<i>upasaṅkamtivā</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>upasaṅkamtivā</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	approached and	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>pubbakāla kriyā visessana</i>
<i>evaṃ</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the following way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>nidassana</i>
<i>vadeti</i>	<i>V-1, 3 Sg.</i>	spoke		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“etha</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Pl.</i>	come!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>maṃ</i>	<i>PG-1, 2 Sg.</i>	me	<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>āvuso</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	friend		<i>ālapana</i>
<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Pl.</i>	ruin		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>iti</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka (speaking-manner indicator)</i>
<i>sāmaṇerā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	the novices	<i>apasādentī</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>apasādentī</i>	<i>V-1, 3 Pl.</i>	disparaged <u>him</u>		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“nassa</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Sg.</i>	perish!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>paṇḍaka</i>	<i>Voc.</i>	gay		<i>āpalana</i>
<i>vinassa</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Sg.</i>	totally perish!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>paṇḍaka</i>	<i>Voc.</i>	gay		<i>āpalana</i>
<i>ko attho</i>	<i>PG-15, NG-1</i>	what to do	<i>hoti (is there)</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>tayā</i>	<i>PG-2, 3 Sg.</i>	with you	<i>ko attho</i>	<i>Sahādi-yoga</i>
<i>iti</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>apasādentī</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka/ (speaking-manner indicator)</i>

So sāmaṇerehi apasādito hatthi-bhaṇḍe assa-bhaṇḍe upasaṅkamtivā evaṃ vadeti, “etha maṃ āvuso dūsethā”ti. Hatthi-bhaṇḍā assa-bhaṇḍā dūsesuṃ. Te ujjhāyanti khiyyanti vipācenti “Paṇḍakā ime samaṇā Sakya-puttiyā; yepi imesaṃ na paṇḍakā, tepi ime paṇḍake dūsetti; evaṃ ime sabbeva a-brahma-cārino”ti.

He —disparaged by the novices —approached elephant-keeper and horse-keeper and, spoke thus: “Come, friends, ruin me.” The elephant-keepers and horse-keepers ruined him. They complained, denounced, criticized thus: “These Sakyan recluses, are gays; whoever among them are not gays; they too ruin these gays. Thus, these all certainly are ignoble/ unchaste ones.”

<i>so</i>	<i>PG-6, 1 Sg.</i>	he	<i>1. apasādito</i> <i>2. upasaṅkamtivā,</i> <i>vadeti</i>	<i>1. kamma</i> <i>2. kattā</i>
<i>sāmaṇerehi</i>	<i>NG-1, 3 Pl.</i>	by the novices	<i>apasādito</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>apasādito</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	(being) disparaged	<i>hutvā/ samāno</i> (understood)	<i>Vikati-kattā</i>
<i>hatthi-bhaṇḍe⁴</i> <i>assa-bhaṇḍe</i>	<i>NG-1, 2 Pl.</i>	elephant-keepers and horse-keepers	<i>upasaṅkamtivā</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>upasaṅkamtivā</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	approached	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>pubbakāla kriyā</i> <i>visessana</i>
<i>evaṃ</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the following way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>nidassana</i>
<i>vadeti</i>	<i>V-1, 3 Sg.</i>	spoke		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“etha</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Pl.</i>	come!		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>maṃ</i>	<i>PG-1, 2 Sg.</i>	me	<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>āvuso</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	friend		<i>ālapana</i>
<i>dūsetha</i>	<i>V-2, 2 Pl.</i>	ruin		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>iti</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>vadeti</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka –</i> (speaking-manner indicator)
<i>hatthi-bhaṇḍā</i> <i>assa-bhaṇḍā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	elephant-keepers horse-keepers	<i>dūsesuṃ</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>dūsesuṃ</i>	<i>V-6, 3 Pl.</i>	ruin		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>te</i>	<i>PG-6, 1 Pl.</i>	they	<i>ujjhāyanti... vipācenti</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>ujjhāyanti khiyyanti</i> <i>vipācenti</i>	<i>V-1, 3 Pl.</i>	complained denounced criticized		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>“paṇḍakā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	gays	<i>honti (understood)</i>	<i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>ime</i>	<i>PG-3, 1 Pl.</i>	these	<i>samaṇā</i>	adjective
<i>samaṇā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	recluses	<i>honti</i>	<i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>Sakya-puttiyā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	Sakyan	<i>samaṇā</i>	adjective
<i>yepi</i>	<i>PG-12, 1 Pl.</i>	whoever	<i>honti (understood)</i>	<i>pakati-kattā</i> <i>niddhāraṇīya</i> (selected)
<i>imesaṃ</i>	<i>PG-3, 6 Pl.</i>	among them	<i>ye</i>	<i>niddhāraṇa-</i> <i>samudāya (whole)⁵,</i> <i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>na</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	not	<i>honti (understood)</i>	adverb
<i>paṇḍakā</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Pl.</i>	gays	<i>honti (understood)</i>	<i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>tepi</i>	<i>PG-6, 1 Pl.</i>	they too	<i>dūsentī</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>ime</i>	<i>PG-3, 2 Pl.</i>	these	<i>paṇḍake</i>	adjective

⁴ *hatthibhaṇḍa assabhaṇḍa*; *hatthi*: elephant; *bhaṇḍa*: keeper or someone who deals with or manages.. Vin-a.1015 explains *bhaṇḍa* by *gopaka*, guardian, watchman.

⁵ Ref. Syntax of Cases. Partitive **genitive**: denoting a part of the whole which is designated by the noun it qualifies, as in: *sabbayodhānam atisūro* ‘of all-warriors+bravest’ = ‘of all the warriors, he is the bravest’; *brāhmanānam so paṇḍito* ‘among Brahmins+he+wise’ = ‘among Brahmins, he is wise’.

<i>paṇḍake</i>	<i>NG-1, 2 Pl.</i>	gays	<i>dūśenti</i>	<i>kamma</i>
<i>dūśenti</i>	<i>V-1, 3 Pl.</i>	ruin		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>evaṃ</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)		<i>nidassana</i>
<i>ime</i>	<i>PG-3, 1 Pl.</i>	these	<i>honti</i> (understood)	<i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>sabbeva</i>	<i>PG-19, 1 Pl.</i>	all certainly	<i>ime</i>	adjective
<i>a-brahma-cārino</i>	<i>NG-15, 1 Pl.</i>	ignoble/ unchaste ones	<i>honti</i> (understood)	<i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>iti</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	Thus (in the afore-mentioned way)	<i>ujjhāyanti... vipācenti</i>	<i>ākāra-jotaka</i>

Assosum kho bhikkhū tesam hatthi-bhaṇḍānaṃ assa-bhaṇḍānaṃ ujjhāyantānaṃ khiyyantānaṃ vipacentānaṃ. Atha kho te bhikkhū Bhagavato etamatthaṃ ārocesum.

Monks heard those elephant-keepers and horse-keepers, denouncing, criticizing. Then, those monks told this matter to the Buddha.

<i>assosum kho</i>	<i>V-6, 3 Pl.</i>	heard		<i>kriyā</i>
<i>bhikkhū</i>	<i>NG-17, 1 Pl.</i>	Monks those,	<i>assosum</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>tesam</i>	<i>PG-6, 6 Pl.</i>	those	<i>hatthi-bhaṇḍānaṃ,</i> <i>assa-bhaṇḍānaṃ</i>	adjective
<i>hatthi-bhaṇḍānaṃ</i> <i>assa-bhaṇḍānaṃ</i>	<i>NG-1, 4 Pl.</i>	the elephant-keepers the horse-keepers	<i>assosum</i> (monks heard them)	dative (<i>pakati-</i> <i>kamma</i>)
<i>ujjhāyantānaṃ</i> <i>khiyyantānaṃ</i> <i>vipacentānaṃ</i>	<i>NG-1, 4 Pl.</i>	complaining condemning criticizing	1. <i>hatthi-bhaṇḍānaṃ...</i> 2. <i>assosum</i>	1. adjective 2. <i>vikati-kamma</i>
<i>atha kho</i>	<i>Nip.</i>	then	<i>ārocesum</i>	<i>kāladhāra</i>
<i>te</i>	<i>PG-6, 1 Pl.</i>	these	<i>bhikkhū</i>	adjective
<i>bhikkhū</i>	<i>NG-17, 1 Pl.</i>	monks	<i>ārocesum</i>	<i>kattā</i>
<i>Bhagavato</i> (<i>bhagavantam</i>)	<i>NG-6, 4 Sg.</i>	to the Buddha	<i>ārocesum</i> (if “ <i>avocum</i> ”) ⁶	<i>sampadāna</i> (secondary object)
<i>etamatthaṃ</i>	<i>NG-1, 2 Sg.</i>	this matter	<i>ārocesum</i> (if “ <i>avocum</i> ”)	<i>kamma</i> (primary object)
<i>ārocesum</i>	<i>V-6, 3 Pl.</i>	told		<i>kriyā</i>

“*Paṇḍako, bhikkhave—anupasampanno—na upasampādetabbo; upasampanno—nāsetabbo*”*ti.*

“Monks, a gay —if not ordained —should not be ordained; if ordained —should be expelled.”
Thus, the Buddha said.

<i>“paṇḍako</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	, a gay	<i>hoti</i> (understood)	<i>pakati-kattā</i>
<i>bhikkhave</i>	<i>Voc.</i>	Monks		<i>ālapana</i>
<i>anupasampanno</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	[if] not being ordained	<i>samāno</i> (understood)	<i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>na</i>		not	<i>upasampādetabbo</i>	adverb

⁶ If it were “*acocum*” (synonymous with “*ārocesum*”), it would be “*Bhikkhū bhagavantam etamatthaṃ avocum,*” as in the case of “*Te mānavakā bhagavantam etaṃ avocum*” (Di-1, 88). Obviously, in this case, *bhagavantam* is a secondary object (*apadhāna-kamma*), and *etaṃ* is a primary object (*padhāna-kamma*). Thus, the secondary object becomes dative when connected to certain verb, like *aroceti*, *deti*, *suṇāti*, and so on. In Rūpasiddhi (140/ 153), the secondary object (*a-padhāna*) is called *akathita-kamma*, and primary object (*padhāna*) is *kathita-kamma*.

<i>upasampādetabbo</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	should (not) be ordained		<i>kitaka kriyā</i>
<i>upasampanno</i>	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	if being ordained	<i>samāno</i> (understood)	<i>vikati-kattā</i>
<i>nāsetabbo</i> ”ti	<i>NG-1, 1 Sg.</i>	should be expelled		<i>kitaka kriyā</i>