

Naughty Nandā

(V-2, 407)

Tena samayena, Buddho Bhagavā Sāvattiyam viharati Jetavane Anāthapiṇḍikassa ārāme. Tena kho pana samayena, Caṇḍa-kālī¹ bhikkhunī bhaṇḍana-kārikā hoti kalaha-kārikā vivāda-kārikā bhassa-kārikā saṃghe adhikaraṇa-kārikā. Thulla-Nandā bhikkhunī tassā kamme kariyamāne paṭikkosati.

At that time, the Buddha the Blessed One dwelled at Sāvattī in the Jeta Grove in Anātha-piṇḍika's monastery. At that time the nun Caṇḍa-kālī was a strife-maker, a quarrel-maker, a contention-maker, a brawl-maker, a disputes-maker in the Order. When action is taken against her, the nun Thulla-nandā rejected that.

Alternative: At that time (tena kho pana samayena), the nun Caṇḍa-kālī (Caṇḍa-kālī bhikkhunī) was quarrelsome (bhaṇḍana-kārikā hoti), contentious (kalaha-kārikā), argumentative (vivāda-kārikā), offensive (bhassa-kārikā), and a maker of disputes (adhikaraṇa-kārikā) in the Saṅgha (saṃghe). The nun Thulla-Nandā (Thulla-Nandā bhikkhunī), when action is taken against her, objected.

- *bhaṇḍanakārikā* = *bhaṇḍana* + *kārikā*
 - *bhaṇḍana* nt. blaming; accusing; conflicting [$\sqrt{bhaṇḍ}$ + *ana*]
 - *kārikā* 1 fem. (+gen) performance (of); doing (of); practice (of) [\sqrt{kar} + *a* + **ikā*]. *Kārako* masc.
 - **Viggaha**: *bhaṇḍanassa* + *kārikā*'ti *bhaṇḍanakārikā* (*chatthī tappurisa*)
- *Kalaha* masc. quarrel; dispute; argument [\sqrt{kalah} + *a*]
- *vivāda* 1 masc. quarrel; dispute; argument; lit. opposite view [*vi* + \sqrt{vad} + **a*]
- *bhassa* 1.1 nt. speech; talk; conversation [$\sqrt{bhās}$ + *a*]

<i>tena samayena</i>		at that time		
<i>Buddho</i>		the Buddha		
<i>Bhagavā</i>		the Blessed One		
<i>Sāvattiyam</i>		1. at Sāvattī 2. at Sāvattī		
<i>viharati</i>		dwelled		
<i>Jetavane</i>		in the Jeta Grove		
<i>Anāthapiṇḍikassa</i>		of Anātha-piṇḍika's		
<i>ārāme</i>		in the monastery		
<i>tena kho pana samayena</i>		at that time		
<i>Caṇḍa-kālī</i>		Caṇḍa-kālī		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		the nun		
<i>bhaṇḍana-kārikā</i>		a strife-maker		
<i>hoti</i>		was		
<i>kalaha-kārikā</i>		a quarrel-maker		
<i>vivāda-kārikā</i>		a contention-maker		
<i>bhassa-kārikā</i>		a brawl-maker		
<i>saṃghe</i>		in the Order		

¹ *caṇḍakālī* fem. name of a nun; lit. fierce black [*caṇḍa* + *kālī*]

<i>adhikaraṇa-kārikā</i>		a dispute-maker		
<i>Thulla-Nandā</i>		Thulla-Nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		the nun		
<i>tassā</i>		to/against her		
<i>kamme</i>		when action		
<i>karīyamāne</i>		is taken		
<i>paṭikkosati</i>		rejected		

Tena kho pana samayena, Thulla-nandā bhikkhunī gāmakam agamāsi kenacideva karaṇīyena. Atha kho, bhikkhuni-saṃgho “Thulla-nandā bhikkhunī pakkantā”ti Caṇḍa-kāḷim bhikkhunim āpattiyā adassane ukkhipi. Thulla-nandā bhikkhunī gāmake taṃ karaṇīyaṃ tīretvā punadeva Sāvattim paccāgacchi.

At that time, the nun Thulla-nandā went to a small village just for some tasks. Then, the nun Order — knowing thus, “the nun Thulla-nandā left”²—kicked out the nun Caṇḍa-kāḷī **on grounds of** not seeing the offence. The nun Thulla-nandā —having finished that task —returned back just to Sāvatti.

<i>tena kho pana samayena</i>		at that time		
<i>Thulla-nandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		the nun		
<i>gāmakam</i>		to a small village		
<i>agamāsi</i>		went		
<i>kenaci (nt.)</i>		for something		
<i>eva (kenacideva)</i>		just		
<i>karaṇīyena</i>		due to a task		
<i>atha kho</i>		then		
<i>bhikkhuni-saṃgho</i>		the nun Order		
<i>“Thulla-nandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		the nun		
<i>pakkantā”</i>		left		
<i>iti</i>		<u>knowing</u> thus		
<i>Caṇḍa-kāḷim</i>		Caṇḍa-kāḷī		
<i>bhikkhunim</i>		the nun		
<i>āpattiyā</i>		the offence		
<i>adassane</i>		on grounds of not seeing		
<i>ukkhipi</i>		kicked out		
<i>Thulla-nandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		the nun		
<i>gāmake</i>		in the small village		

² This is an interrupting clause because it interrupts the main clause. So, to avoid confusion, it is put between two long dashes. Otherwise, it can be moved before or after the main clause.

<i>taṃ</i>		that		
<i>karaṇīyaṃ</i>		task		
<i>tīretvā</i>		having finished and		
<i>puna</i>		again		
<i>eva (punadeva)</i>		just		
<i>Sāvattiṃ</i>		to Sāvatti		
<i>paccāgacchi</i>		returned		

Caṇḍa-kāḷi bhikkhunī Thulla-nandāya bhikkhuniyā āgacchantiyā neva āsanaṃ paññapesi; na pādodakaṃ pāda-pīṭhaṃ pāda-kaṭhalikaṃ upanikkhipi; na paccuggantvā patta-cīvaram paṭiggahesi; na pānīyena āpucchi.

The nun Caṇḍa-kāḷī —[although/ when³/ for] the nun Thulla-nandā coming back —did not spread out a sitting rug; did not lay/ arrange feet-cleaning water, feet-cleaning board, feet-cleaning stone; did not come forward and take her bowl and robe; did not invite her with drinking water.

<i>caṇḍa-kāḷi</i>		Caṇḍa-kāḷī		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		The nun		
<i>Thulla-nandāya</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhuniyā</i>		when the nun		
<i>āgacchantiyā</i>		coming back		
<i>neva (first na)</i>		not		
<i>āsanaṃ</i>		a sitting rug		
<i>paññapesi</i>		did spread out		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>pādodakaṃ</i>		feet-cleaning water		
<i>pādapīṭhaṃ</i>		feet-cleaning board		
<i>pādakaṭhalikaṃ</i>		feet-cleaning stone		
<i>upanikkhipi</i>		did lay/arrange		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>paccuggantvā</i>		did come forward <u>and</u>		
<i>pattacīvaram</i>		her bowl and robe		
<i>paṭiggahesi</i>		take		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>pānīyena</i>		with drinking water		
<i>āpucchi</i>		did invite <u>her</u>		

³ The phrase headed by “although” is called *anādariya* (ignored clause), and the phrase headed by “when” is *lakkhaṇa* (time-indicator clause). In the “although” clause, the subject and verb (present participle), both are sixth forms, and in the “when-phrase,” both their seventh forms. In this sentence, however, given the phrase, “*mayi āgacchantiyā*,” in the next sentence, this is certainly “when-phrase” (*kāla-lakkhaṇa*).

Thulla-nandā bhikkhunī Caṇḍa-kālīṃ bhikkhunīṃ etadvoca “Kissa tvam, aye, mayi āgacchantiyā neva āsanam paññapesi; na pādodakam pāda-pīṭham pāda-kaṭhalikam upanikkhipi; na paccuggantvā patta-cīvaram paṭiggahesi; na pānīyena āpucchi”ti.

Nun Thulla-nandā said this to nun Caṇḍa-kālī thus, “My friend —when I came back —why did you not spread out a sitting rug; did not lay/ arrange feet-cleaning water, feet-cleaning board, feet-cleaning stone; did not come forward and take my bowl and robe; did not invite me with drinking water.

<i>Thulla-nandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		nun		
<i>Caṇḍa-kālīṃ</i>		Caṇḍa-kālī		
<i>bhikkhunīṃ</i>		to nun		
<i>etadvoca</i>		said this		
<i>“kissa</i>		why		
<i>tvam</i>		you		
<i>aye</i>		my friend		
<i>mayi</i>		when I		
<i>āgacchantiyā</i>		came back		
<i>neva</i>		not		
<i>āsanam</i>		a sitting rug		
<i>paññapesi</i>		did spread out		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>pādodakam</i>		feet-cleaning water		
<i>pāda-pīṭham</i>		feet-cleaning board		
<i>pāda-kaṭhalikam</i>		feet-cleaning stone		
<i>upanikkhipi</i>		did lay/arrange		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>paccuggantvā</i>		did come forward <u>and</u>		
<i>patta-cīvaram</i>		<u>my</u> bowl and robe		
<i>paṭiggahesi</i>		take		
<i>na</i>		not		
<i>pānīyena</i>		with drinking water		
<i>āpucchi”ti</i>		did invite <u>me</u>		

Evam hetam, aye, hoti, yathā taṃ anāthāyā”ti. “Kissa pana tvam, ayye, anāthā”ti. “Imā maṃ, ayye, bhikkhuniyo— ‘Ayaṃ anāthā appaññātā; Natthi imissā kāci pativattā’ti—āpattiyā adassane ukkhipiṃsū”ti.

“My friend, exactly in the same way this happens to me as it happens to a defenseless one,” thus Caṇḍa-kālī said. “But how come, friend, you are defenseless?” Thus Thulla-nandā asked. “My

friend, these nuns —thinking thus, ‘This one is defenseless and nameless; there is not any counter-speaker⁴ for her —kicked me out on grounds of not seeing the offence,’” thus she replied.

<i>evaṃ</i>		in the same way		
<i>hi (hetam)</i>		exactly		
<i>etaṃ</i>		this		
<i>ayye (fem.)</i>		My friend		
<i>hoti</i>		happens <u>to me</u>		
<i>yathā</i>		as		
<i>taṃ</i>		it <u>happens</u>		
<i>anāthāyā”ti</i>		to a defenseless one		
<i>“kissa</i>		how come		
<i>pana</i>		but		
<i>tvaṃ</i>		you		
<i>ayye</i>		friend		
<i>anāthā”ti</i>		defenseless		
<i>“imā</i>		these		
<i>maṃ</i>		me		
<i>ayye</i>		friend		
<i>bhikkhuniyo</i>		nuns		
<i>‘ayaṃ</i>		this one <u>is</u>		
<i>anāthā</i>		defenseless		
<i>appaññātā</i>		nameless		
<i>natthi</i>		there is not		
<i>imissā (fem.)</i>		for her		
<i>kāci</i>		any		
<i>pativattā’</i>		counter-speaker		
<i>iti</i>		<u>thinking</u> thus		
<i>āpattiyā</i>		of the offence		
<i>adassane</i>		on grounds of not seeing		
<i>ukkipiṃsū”ti</i>		kicked out		

Thullanandā bhikkhunī “Bālā etā; abyattā etā; netā jānanti kammaṃ vā, kamma-dosaṃ vā, kamma-vipattiṃ vā, kamma-sampattiṃ vā”ti caṇḍīkata gaṇaṃ paribhāsi. Yā tā bhikkhuniyo appicchā....., tā ujjjayanti khiyyanti vipacenti, “Kathaṃ hi nāma ayyā Thulla-nandā caṇḍīkatā gaṇaṃ paribhāsissatī”ti.....

Nun Thulla-nandā, being hostile, defamed the group thus, “Stupid are these!; Inexperienced are these!; they do not even know an act, the defect of an act or the failure of an act or the success of an act.” Whoever nuns are modest , they complained, condemned and criticized thus, “How come **the venerable** Thulla-nandā being hostile defamed the group!”

<i>Thullanandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
--------------------	--	--------------	--	--

⁴ “Pati-vattā” (as in the case of *pati-vipassanā*) is literally translated as “counter-speaker” (as in the case of counter-attack). When nuns pointed out the mistake done by *Caṇḍa-kālī*, the nun *Thulla-Nandā* spoke against them by defending her friend. That is why *Thulla-Nandā* is called a counter-speaker (*pati-vattā*). [In the same way, *paccācikkhati (pati-ācikkhati)* means “counter-speak,” i.e., reply]

<i>bhikkhunī</i>		nun		
“ <i>bālā</i> ”		stupid		
<i>etā</i>		these		
<i>abyattā</i>		inexperienced		
<i>etā</i>		these		
<i>na (netā)</i>		not		
<i>etā</i>		they		
<i>jānanti</i>		know		
<i>kammaṃ</i>		an act		
<i>vā</i>		or		
<i>kamma-dosaṃ</i>		the defect of an act		
<i>vā</i>		or		
<i>kamma-vipattiṃ</i>		the failure of an act		
<i>vā</i>		or		
<i>kamma-sampattiṃ</i>		the success of an act		
<i>vā</i> ”		or		
<i>iti</i>		thus		
<i>caṇḍīkatā</i>		being hostile		
<i>hutvā (understood)</i>				
<i>gaṇaṃ</i>		the group		
<i>paribhāsi</i>		defamed		
<i>yā tā</i>		whoever		
<i>bhikkhuniyo</i>		nuns		
<i>appicchā....</i>		are modest		
<i>tā</i>		they		
<i>ujjayanti</i>		complained		
<i>khiyyanti</i>		condemned		
<i>vipacenti</i>		criticized		
<i>kathaṃ hi nāma</i>		how dare/ how could (or why)		
<i>ayyā</i>		venerable		
<i>Thulla-nandā</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>caṇḍīkatā</i>		being hostile		
<i>gaṇaṃ</i>		the group		
<i>paribhāsissati” ...</i>		defamed		
<i>iti</i>		[saying] thus		

“*Saccaṃ kira, bhikkhave, Thulla-nanda bhikkhunī caṇḍīkatā gaṇaṃ paribhāsati?*”*ti.* “*Saccaṃ Bhagavā*”*ti.* *Vigarahi Buddho Bhagavā.....* “*Kathaṃ hi nāma bhikkhave Thullananda bhikkhunī caṇḍīkatā gaṇaṃ paribhāsissati.*”

“Monks, is it true as said that the nun Thulla-nandā, being hostile, defamed the group?” thus the Buddha asked. “It is true, the Blessed One,” thus they replied. The Buddha the Blessed One, condemned her thus: “How come, monks, the nun Thulla-nandā, being hostile, defamed the group!”

“ <i>saccaṃ</i> ”		is it true		
<i>kira</i>		as they say		
<i>bhikkhave</i>		monks		

<i>Thulla-nanda</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		nun		
<i>caṇḍīkatā</i>		being hostile		
<i>gaṇaṃ</i>		the group		
<i>paribhāsati? ”ti</i>		defamed		
“ <i>Saccaṃ</i>		it is true		
<i>Bhagavā</i> ”		Blessed One		
<i>iti</i>		thus <u>they replied</u>		
<i>vigarahi</i>		condemned <u>her</u>		
<i>Buddho</i>		The Buddha		
<i>Bhagavā.....</i>		the Blessed One		
“ <i>kathaṃ hi nāma</i>		how dare/ how could (or why)		
<i>bhikkhave</i>		monks		
<i>Thullananda</i>		Thulla-nandā		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		nun		
<i>caṇḍīkatā</i>		being hostile		
<i>gaṇaṃ</i>		the group		
<i>paribhāsissati</i>		defamed		

Netam, bhikkhave, appasannānaṃ va pasādāya..... Evañca pana, bhikkhave, bhikkhuniyo imaṃ sikkhāpadaṃ uddisantu— “Yā pana bhikkhunī caṇḍīkatā gaṇaṃ paribhāseyya, pācittiyaṃ”ti.

This is not, monks, for displeased ones to become pleased... And in this way also, monks, let nuns recite this precept thus —“Whoever nun, being hostile, should defame a group, there is an offence of expiation.”

<i>netam (na etaṃ)</i>		it is not		
<i>bhikkhave</i>		monks		
<i>appasannānaṃ</i> ⁵		of the displeased ones		
<i>vā</i>		or		
<i>pasādāya</i> ⁶ ...		for the pleasing (i.e., to become pleased)		
<i>evañ ca pana</i>		and also/ and thus/ and in this way		
<i>bhikkhave</i>		Monks		
<i>bhikkhuniyo</i>		the nuns		
<i>imaṃ</i>		this		
<i>sikkhāpadaṃ</i>		rule of training		
<i>uddisantu</i> ⁷		let [the nuns] recite		
“ <i>yā pana</i>		whoever/ any		
<i>bhikkhunī</i>		nun		

⁵ *appasanna* 1 masc. (+loc) non-believer; who has no faith (in); who is without confidence (in) [*na + pa + vsad + na*]. Root *vsad* 1 a (sink, sit, settle) 279.

⁶ *pasāda* 1 masc. inspiration; faith; trust; confidence; lit. settling [*pa + vsad + *a*].

⁷ *uddisati* 1 pr. (+acc) recites; chants; lit. points up [*ud + vdis + a + ti*].

<i>caṇḍīkatā</i>		being hostile		
<i>gaṇaṃ</i>		a group		
<i>paribhāseyya</i>		should defame		
<i>pācittiyaṃ</i>		[there is] an offence entailing expiation		
<i>iti</i>		thus		